philippine studies: historical and ethnographic viewpoints

Ateneo de Manila University · Lovola Heights, Quezon City · 1108 Philippines

Research Note

The Early Periodicals of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente (1903–1904) and the Emergence of a Transregional and Transcontinental Indigenous-Christian Public Sphere

Adrian Hermann

Philippine Studies: Historical and Ethnographic Viewpoints vol. 62 nos. 3–4 (2014): 549–65

Copyright © Ateneo de Manila University

Philippine Studies: Historical and Ethnographic Viewpoints is published by the Ateneo de Manila University. Contents may not be copied or sent via email or other means to multiple sites and posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's written permission. Users may download and print articles for individual, noncommercial use only. However, unless prior permission has been obtained, you may not download an entire issue of a journal, or download multiple copies of articles.

Please contact the publisher for any further use of this work at philstudies.soss@ateneo.edu.

http://www.philippinestudies.net

Research Note

ADRIAN HERMANN

The Early Periodicals of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente (1903–1904) and the Emergence of a Transregional and Transcontinental Indigenous-Christian Public Sphere

The early periodicals of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente (IFI), *La Verdad* (1903) and *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica* (1903–1904), have been quoted as primary sources but have not been explored in their own right. Since its beginnings, the IFI understood itself as belonging to a transcontinental, global movement of independent Catholic churches. The periodicals published various letters that the IFI had received from foreign Catholic groups that were similarly independent of Rome. This research note focuses on these periodicals and locates the IFI in an emerging transregional and transcontinental indigenous-Christian public sphere.

KEYWORDS: IGLESIA FILIPINA INDEPENDIENTE · PERIODICALS · INDIGENOUS-CHRISTIAN ELITE · PUBLIC SPHERE

he "religious revolution" in the Philippines around 1900 has been studied intensively over the course of the last century, leading to widely varying assessments (e.g., Rodriguez 1960; Achutegui and Bernad 1961–1972; Whittemore 1961; Clifford 1969; Schumacher 1981; Scott 1963, 1987). Recently there has been a renewed interest in certain aspects of its history (Ranche 2000; Gealogo 2010, 2011; Boer and Smit 2008, 2012; Revollido 2009; Smit 2011, 2013) and especially in the figure of Isabelo de los Reyes (1864-1938) (Bragado 2002; Anderson 2005; Thomas 2006, 2012; Demeterio 2012; Mojares 2006, 2013). In 1988, in a review of the historical study of the founding of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente (IFI), Paul A. Rodell (1988, 234) concluded that "for almost ninety years . . . the intensity of . . . religious debate has colored the historiography of this important event." However, the research that has appeared in the last decades of the twentieth century and especially the renewed interest in the early history of the IFI since the 2000s take us away from these confessional conflicts and open up the study of religious change in the Philippines around 1900 to a variety of new perspectives developed in the study of religion over the course of the last thirty years.

In these new studies, however, not much attention has been paid to the importance of the early periodicals published by the IFI in 1903 and 1904 for the new church's identity. This research note presents a first look at their role in the early years of the IFI's existence. My study of the IFI periodicals forms part of a comparative project on "Indigenous-Christian Elites in Asia and Africa around 1900 as Reflected in their Journals and Periodicals," which is based at the University of Munich and the University of Applied Sciences Hermannsburg, with case studies on South Africa, West Africa, India, and the Philippines (cf. Koschorke 2014, 185–90). Since the comparative project takes as its point of departure the history of Christianity in India and the Madras-based periodical Christian Patriot (1890–1929), the designation "indigenous-Christian" has been chosen as a comparative category because it has a well-established history in India (cf. Baagø 1969)—despite the fact that the description of the ilustrado elite as "indigenous" might appear to be misleading since "indigenous" in the Philippine context today is usually understood as referring to national cultural communities such as the Igorot, the Negrito, or the Lumad.

On 1 October 1870 the following statement appeared in the first issue of *The Kaffir Express*, one of the earliest periodicals in colonial South Africa

partly edited by members of the native Xhosa Christian elite (Switzer and Switzer 1979, 49–50):

The Period when newspapers begin to live in the history of any people is an important era. This diminutive messenger is sent forth to ascertain if that time has arrived among the native people of this country. . . . The paper will be addressed to the intelligent portion of the native community who are able to read, or have an interest in what is going on in the world beyond their own dwellings.

Published in the periodical's first issue, this programmatic article indicated the importance that the educated South African Christian elite placed on the newspaper as a vehicle of knowledge about global events and on the availability of a means of independent access to the wider world. At the same time the emergence of this and similar journals pointed to a new situation in colonial Africa in which—mainly through the success of missionary schools—an educated native elite had emerged, which then became available as a public to be addressed by such publications. In January 1883 a contemporary letter to the editor of Botswana's first vernacular journal reflected a similar sentiment:

I hear that you plan to publish a small newspaper for Batswana in their language. How happy we will be if you do that! To tell you the truth, we are tired of rumours, because sometimes when we expect news we hear a rumour, which then needs to be verified by the newspapers of the Europeans. We are also tired of continually asking Europeans about the news of other nations. . . . Thank you, teacher. (Mgadla and Volz 2006, 7–9)

Drawing on the work of Christopher A. Bayly (1996), Mark R. Frost (2004), Neeladri Bhattacharya (2005), Smita Lahiri (2007), John D. Blanco (2009), and others, my case study (as well as the larger comparative project of which it is a part) is interested in the possibilities for mutual awareness, as well as indirect and later direct contacts between indigenous-Christian elites in a colonial public sphere that resulted from the emergence of indigenous-Christian periodicals, journals, and newspapers. As interventions in the public sphere these publications served to consolidate local communities

and the elite's visions of itself, but also allowed native Christians to raise their voices and constitute themselves as important and relevant members of their national communities.

In this context our project is especially concerned with the emergence of mutual awareness between indigenous-Christian elites in Africa and Asia and the early development of transregional and transcontinental contacts. One of the paradigmatic examples is an article in the Indian indigenous-Christian journal *Christian Patriot* (1898, 5), which quotes a report about three African bishops present in England at the Fourth Lambeth Conference of 1897 and comments on it in the following way: "When is India to have her own native Bishops?" Similarly, the early periodicals of the IFI that I analyze in my case study show awareness of and offer comments on the situation of Christians in a variety of other countries to develop arguments for the empowerment of the indigenous clergy in the Philippines and the legitimacy of the break with Rome. In the remainder of this note, I place these sources in a larger context to highlight the central role of such journals and periodicals for the history of indigenous-Christian elites in Africa and Asia around 1900.

The IFI's Early Periodicals

The founding of the IFI in August 1902 was a late result of the long-standing struggle of the Filipino clergy against institutional discrimination and the hegemony of the friars in the Philippines, a conflict that had intensified during the second half of the nineteenth century. While the IFI's history has been reconstructed in much detail over the course of the twentieth century, none of these studies have closely focused on the early periodicals published by a number of activists connected to the church in the years 1903 and 1904. These journals served as the IFI's official organs, publishing important documents, such as the church's constitution and an outline of its organizational structure, as well as pastoral letters. Furthermore, they allowed the IFI to voice its concerns and its own interpretations of current events to the Philippine public by engaging in debate with other contemporary religious periodicals such as the Dominican friars' *Libertas*. In addition to these local concerns, they provided the IFI with a way of presenting the new Filipino national church as part of a global Christian community.

The first IFI periodical, named *La Verdad*, was published from 21 January to 5 August 1903, for a total of twenty-nine issues. It was run and edited by the American Arthur W. Prautch together with Manuel Xerez-Burgos (a nephew

of the martyr-priest José Burgos, who was accused of sedition and executed in 1872) and Cenon Hilario (whose name disappears from the header after the fifth issue). When Prautch quit after twelve issues, Xerez-Burgos took over the main editorship, with help from Lázaro Makapagal.⁵ The articles in *La Verdad* were written in English, Spanish, and Tagalog. The second periodical, *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica*, was edited by Isabelo de los Reyes. It appeared from 11 October 1903 to 15 December 1904, for a total of fifty-five issues. It contained articles in Spanish as well as in Tagalog and other Philippine languages. After the fortieth issue, one of De los Reyes's sons took over the editorship because Isabelo was preparing to leave the country.

A third periodical that appeared in the IFI's early years was the workers' union's La Redención del Obrero, with twenty issues published from 8 October 1903 to 18 February 1904. Its articles were mostly in Spanish, although some were in Philippine languages. Likewise edited and published by De los Reyes in the same layout and format as the church paper, it claimed distribution "in the whole Philippines" (en todo Filipinas) together with La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica as stated in both journals' headers. Even after its demise La Redención del Obrero lived on in the form of a "Section for the Workers" (Sección para los obreros) that appeared irregularly in La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica. De los Reyes was not only one of the founders of the IFI but previously in 1901 he had also founded the Unión Obrera Democrática, the first Filipino labor union (Scott 1992), and had even proclaimed the new church at a meeting of the workers' unions; the close connection between the spread of the church paper and the workers' paper provides another insight into the close links between the various movements of social, political, and religious emancipation in the Philippines around 1900.

Programmatic Vision and Local Importance

Two programmatic texts published in *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente*: *Revista Católica* provide an insight into the aspirations of the early IFI periodicals. The texts explain the IFI's motivation for publishing its own journals as early as the first year of the new church's existence.

The first text, titled "Our Aspiration" (*Nuestra Aspiración*), appeared in the first issue on 14 October 1903 and stated:⁶

We sincerely aspire to make a periodical that deserves the title of Christian because of its love for God, because of its profound respect for the sacred things, [and] because of the charitableness that can be felt in all of its lines . . . It would be malignant if we were hoping to find our success in fighting systematically against the Romanists, exploiting the passions of our coreligionists and dividing more and more our compatriots that profess different religions. . . . On the contrary, we will show to our people that it is proper to each civilized and well-educated person to respect other beliefs . . . We therefore give a formal promise that if the other religions do not throw the first stone, we will live in sacred peace with them; and that if they do fight with us, that we will know to contest them with measure and always with the charity that our Divine Master teaches us. . . . We send our respectful salute to the Principals of our Holy Church and the rest of the brothers and sisters, to the civil authorities, to the press, and to the general public. (La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica 1903b, 1)

Here the author presented *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica* as a Christian press organ, which would speak for the IFI in the public sphere to give voice to its opinions and engage in critical dialogue with the general public. At the same time, the IFI—in this text as well as over the whole print run of the journal—took special care not to appear as a disturbance to public order or even be perceived as revolutionary. On the contrary, the IFI stressed again and again that its publicly expressed opinions were meant to engage in a civil and friendly dialogue with the authorities as well as other religions, and at the same time assert its right to speak for Filipino Catholics and the long-oppressed Filipino clergy.

One year later, in the fifty-second issue, which appeared on 1 November 1904, *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica* published a second programmatic article that reflected on its first year of existence:

Today the Revista cátolica La Iglesia Filipina Independiente, the official organ of our Community, celebrates one year of life . . . In this collection are found the Catechism and the rest of the doctrines, the rules, the history, and the most solid defense of our Church in all questions, and this organ has certainly arrived to fill a void, not only to defend us immediately against all the intrigues of our relentless

enemies, but also to contradict in an irrefutable way those who claim that we do not have proper doctrines or rules except for a ridiculous imitation of Romanism or the sects. . . . [W]e ask our faithful brethren, especially the Bishops, Parish Priests, Committees of ladies and gentlemen to actively promote our organ, which we need very much, and we request every bishop, parish priest, committee of gentlemen and commission of ladies that they subscribe at least to ten issues of propaganda (Aglipay 1904, 205)

This programmatic assessment once again highlighted the periodical's importance as a public voice for the IFI, allowing church officials to voice their *own* opinions and counter the attacks they perceived their church to be under. At the same time, the Supreme Bishop—whose duty was not only to act as spiritual head but also as chief executive of the IFI—took this opportunity to remind the faithful, and especially the clergy and various officials of the church, to subscribe to the periodical so it could fulfill its purpose for the community.

Also attesting to the central role of these periodicals in the early years of the IFI is a short fundraising letter, apparently circulated by Supreme Bishop Gregorio Aglipay in early 1906 after *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente:* Revista Católica had ceased publication. In this mass-printed letter dated 1 February 1906 (with an empty line at the top where the addressee's name could be filled in), Aglipay (1906) wrote:

The Iglesia Filipina Independiente understood and felt since its inception the necessity of having an organ that would publish all those issues that affect it, and with this purpose first LA VERDAD saw the light of the day and later LA IGLESIA FILIPINA INDEPENDIENTE, some months after the first one had disappeared. . . . And it is true, an entity with no organ of opinion cannot express itself, and he who says nothing either does not speak because he thinks it is better to be quiet, or because he is inert. To this end, dear compatriot and brother . . . donate the sum of twenty-five Pesos (P25.00) to it and very soon you will have your periodical.

The letter clearly expresses the importance that the IFI attached to its periodicals. As the letter stated, "an entity with no organ of opinion cannot express itself." Evidently the IFI was well aware of the need to speak up

and make its voice heard in the context of the new colonial situation in the Philippines under American rule.

At the same time, the new church saw itself as under observation by a local as well as a global public. The latter was not only watching closely but was also impressed by the early success that the IFI had had among Filipino Catholics. This public, however, was also presented with many negative evaluations of the schism in newspapers and especially in religious periodicals around the world. It was therefore important for the IFI—so the leadership appeared to have thought—to (again) have its own periodical to be able to tell its own version of the story. Furthermore, this wider (Christian) world not only represented a remote public, but also (and not least because of periodicals like these) stood in contact and was in direct correspondence with the independent church. It is to these early transregional and transcontinental contacts of the IFI that I will now turn.

The IFI's Transregional and Transcontinental Contacts

As I have outlined in more detail elsewhere, the IFI in its early period of existence already attempted to establish contacts with other Christian groups and was itself contacted by other independent Catholic movements in Europe, the USA, and Asia (Hermann 2013, 2014). The IFI's early journals not only served to publicize these contacts to its constituency, but were also sent abroad as propaganda material about the church.

Already quite well known is the important first phase of contacts with the Swiss Old Catholics in the 1900s that ultimately failed to result in any close cooperation. The first contact was established through a letter sent to Gregorio Aglipay by Eduard Herzog, who at that time was the Swiss Old Catholic Bishop. Reacting to an article by Aglipay published on 29 October 1903 in the magazine *The Independent* (New York), Herzog (1903) wrote in his letter of 1 December 1903 "that there are in Switzerland, Germany, Holland, Austria similar catholic national Churches as you have organized so happily in your Islands." Herzog's explicit goal in this context was to seek close cooperation with Aglipay and the IFI as a national Catholic church similar to the Swiss Old Catholics in order to "to show the world that it is possible to be catholic everywhere without being submitted to Rome" (ibid.). Over the course of the following years the IFI and Herzog's Old Catholics exchanged a number of letters and sent the churches' respective periodicals (*Der Katholik* as well as *La Verdad* and *Iglesia Filipina Independiente*:

Revista Católica) back and forth between Switzerland and the Philippines. However, they could not agree on doctrinal positions, as Herzog became more and more insistent that the IFI should prove its orthodoxy, whereas his IFI interlocutors were reluctant to provide any definitive statements. The last letter by Herzog seems to have been written on 16 September 1912, regarding the new catechism of the IFI, the content of which Herzog rejected. Aglipay wrote back to Herzog but never received an answer (Boer and Smit 2008, 183–85). In 1965, after contact between the European Old Catholics and the IFI had been reinitiated, this second phase of exchange led to an agreement on full communion between the IFI and the Old Catholic Churches of the Union of Utrecht (Smit 2011, 4–5).

More than seven months before the first letter from Switzerland was addressed to Aglipay in December 1903, another independent Catholic group had already begun to establish contact with the IFI. This group was called the "Independent Catholics of Ceylon" or the "Independent Catholic Church of Ceylon, Goa, and India," whose trustee Stephen Silva first wrote to Aglipay on 23 April 1903. Recent studies on the IFI by Eleuterio Revollido (2009, 112–13) and Peter-Ben Smit (2011, 258) quote this letter of Silva (1903a). However, there is more to the story than reported by them.

The IFI was not the only independent Catholic Church in Asia around 1900, even though it was the largest. In Goa and Ceylon a longer period of struggle had resulted in the proclamation of "The Independent Catholic Church of Ceylon, Goa, and India" in the late 1880s. For centuries, following the principle of Patronado or Royal Patronage, the King of Portugal had nominated the bishops of the Latin rite in India and the dioceses of the other former Portuguese colonies. The abolishment of this arrangement in the second half of the nineteenth century caused unrest among a number of Goan and Ceylonese Catholics, who still had strong sentimental links to Portugal. Under the leadership of the Goan priest Antonio Francisco-Xavier Alvarez and the layman Dr. Pedro Manuel Lisboa Pinto some Ceylonese native priests separated themselves from Rome and formed "The Independent Catholic Church of Ceylon, Goa, and India." The Brahmin Alvarez was elected as the church's Prefect-Apostolic on 10 February 1888; he later became its first bishop. Various attempts at receiving a valid consecration as bishop resulted in his being consecrated in 1889 by the Jacobite Patriarch of Antioch Mar Ignatius Peter III, after which Alvarez started to refer to himself as Mar Julius I of Colombo, Ceylon.¹⁰ In its

first years the church apparently had about 5,000 members (Anson 1964, 105). But especially because of a lack of qualified priests, by 1903 the situation had considerably worsened (Wright 1907, 276). Some years later the independent Catholics were apparently forced to return to the Roman Catholic fold (Ervin 2010, 14).

Prior to this decline, however, the Ceylonese independent Catholics had sought support from Aglipay's church, which they saw as a like-minded movement. Having read about the IFI in an American magazine, Silva (1903a) wrote to Aglipay on 23 April 1903 about the difficulty of continuing their work, since they "cannot get sufficient priests to work independent of Rome" and asked him to "send . . . two priests intelligent and good in their moral conduct." Some months later, a second letter from Ceylon reached the IFI Bishop of Manila, José Evangelista. Dated 11 July 1903 the letter referred to an answer from 4 June that Silva had received from Evangelista together with several copies of the IFI periodical La Verdad. Silva continued: "By this mail I send you two pamphlets published by us one in English and the other in Portuguese as spoken in Ceylon." Once again he explained that the main difficulty of their mission was the lack of priests and asked for "one or two Priests to work in our Mission it will be a great help." Silva (1903b) was also very interested in the situation of the IFI in the Philippines: "We want to know the strength of the Filipino Independent Catholic Church. How many Bishops and Priests are there? How many Christians? How many Churches? When did this Church begin?"

The definitive history of this interaction is still to be written, but some important points are clear. First of all, we can be sure that there was a response from the IFI to the initiative by the Ceylonese independent Catholics. Although no traces of bishop Evangelista's letter of 4 June 1903 to Ceylon have yet been found, we know that the IFI had sent a letter back and had included some issues of *La Verdad* in the shipment. This answer had reached Ceylon, as is attested by Silva's second letter. This exchange, transient as it may have been, represents a rare example of known South–South communication between two independent Catholic churches at the beginning of the twentieth century.

Directing our focus back to the role of the IFI periodicals in this exchange, we can make a number of additional remarks. Not only is Silva's first letter preserved in the IFI archive until today, but the IFI also published it in a Spanish translation in the eighteenth issue of *La Verdad*, which appeared on

20 May 1903. The letter was printed a second time in a Tagalog translation in the twentieth issue on 3 June 1903. Likewise, the second letter appeared in the last issue of *La Verdad*, the twenty-ninth issue on 5 August 1903, this time in the original English as well as in a Spanish and a Tagalog translation. The multiple publications of these letters in different languages speak to the high importance the early leadership of the IFI attributed to them as representing interest in their church by independent Asian Catholics in another country. That the answers sent to Ceylon (as well as Switzerland) were accompanied by recent issues of the IFI journals once again highlights the way in which these early periodicals were used as a medium of representation for the IFI not only toward their constituency in the Philippines but also toward the wider global public.

One additional example is a letter sent by Joseph René Vilatte (1854–1929) from Chicago addressed to Aglipay and dated 23 April 1903. At that time Vilatte, who was one of the central figures of international Catholic independency in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, was archbishop of the "American Catholic Church," an independent Catholic church in the USA. He wrote that he had read about the IFI in American periodicals and promised spiritual support. *La Verdad* (1903, 5) published Vilatte's letter in Spanish (probably a translation) in its twenty-first issue on 10 June 1903 and commented that it was making public "another evident proof of the sympathies" (otra prueba evidente de las simpatías) that the IFI enjoyed in the US and the wider world.

The Emergence of a Transregional and Transcontinental Indigenous-Christian Public Sphere around 1900

I have tried to argue that the periodicals of the IFI were of high importance to the new church in its early years. Although much of their content, like various pastoral letters and the church's constitution and catechism, have long been well known and have been republished in various collections of historical sources on the IFI, the periodicals themselves have not been studied closely. In the perspective presented here, however, they were central organs of propaganda through which the church communicated to the Philippine public its perspective on important issues and events and debated with other journals like the Dominicans' *Libertas*. In addition, through its periodicals the IFI presented itself as one example of an international movement of Catholic independency.

In a broader perspective, I argue that the IFI's early periodicals can be explored as part of the emergence of a transregional and transcontinental indigenous-Christian public sphere around 1900. Indigenous-Christian periodicals, newspapers, and journals are important sources of information about African and Asian Christians and their churches in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century that so far have received far too little scholarly attention. They not only served as mediums of churchly, religious, and political commentary, but also informed local Christians about developments in other parts of the world and especially about the lives and struggles of indigenous Christians in other "mission fields" and colonial societies. In this way, indigenous-Christian periodicals made possible early forms of mutual observation between different indigenous-Christian elites in distant parts of the world and were a first step toward indirect and direct contacts between Christians of different countries and regions—even if, as in the cases presented here, some first contacts might not have been very intense or long-lasting.

At the same time, especially when viewed comparatively, these periodicals appear as incredibly diverse in form, focus, lifetime, and level of indigenous engagement. While these periodicals make it possible to discern the voices of local Christians, these voices are in most cases those of Christian elites, who were not only trying to speak to the public and other Christians but also attempting to establish and consolidate themselves as elites in a colonial public sphere.

The notion of an indigenous-Christian public sphere refers therefore not to an essentialized understanding of the "indigenous" or "native," but as a relational term it calls attention to the emergence of a counter-public that was not identical with—and often in opposition to—the public of the Western-dominated missionary channels of communication. In addition to the renewed attention being paid to missionary journals and missionary networks in recent research (e.g., Habermas 2008, 2014; Jensz and Acke 2013), we therefore should focus more closely on media like the periodicals of the IFI and the early contacts between Christian elites of different Asian and African countries that were facilitated by such publications.

Notes

- The project "Indigenous-Christian Elites in Asia and Africa around 1900 as Reflected in their Journals and Periodicals: Patterns of Cognitive Interaction and Early Forms of Transregional Networking," with case studies on South Africa, West Africa, and India, is funded by the German Research Foundation (2012–2015, principal investigators: Prof. Klaus Koschorke and Prof. Frieder Ludwig). The case study on the Philippines (as well as the writing of this research note) was funded by a postdoctoral grant from the Fritz Thyssen Foundation, Germany (2012–2013, principal investigator: Adrian Hermann). For more information cf. http://www.kg1.evtheol.unimuenchen.de/forschung/projekte/daten/eliten.html (in German, archived at http://webcitation.org/6GOUe4phy).
- 2 For a detailed study of the news reports about the black African bishop Samuel Ajayi Crowther in Christian periodicals in Asia and Africa in the nineteenth century, see Koschorke 2011.
- 3 For more details on the IFI's early periodicals and their transnational concerns, see Hermann 2014, 195–97.
- One example of such an exchange was a series of six columns written by the famous Dominican Francisco Marin-Sola and published under the pen name "Quicoy" in *Libertas* in 1903 (on Marin-Sola's relationship to *Libertas*, see Torre 2013, xv). *La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica* (1903, 32) claimed in the article "A *Libertas*" in its eighth issue that Quicoy's columns were written as a response to an earlier article written by Tomas Arejola (1903, 17–18) in the IFI paper's fifth issue, which was titled "El Romanismo juzgado por un ilustre Filipino en el Japón" (Romanism as Judged by a Distinguished Filipino in Japan). More research on such exchanges between the IFI periodicals and other contemporary publications is needed.
- For more details on the editorship of *La Verdad*, see Hermann 2013, 140–41. Lázaro Makapagal, the Tagalog editor of *La Verdad*, appears to be identical with the revolutionary colonel Lázaro Makapagal, infamous for his role in the execution of the revolutionary leaders Andres and Procopio Bonifacio on 10 May 1897.
- 6 The translations from the original Spanish to English of the three lengthy quotations from La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica in this section are by the present author.
- 7 On the early negotiations with the Anglican bishop Charles H. Brent, see Achutegui and Bernad 1960.
- 8 For a meticulous reconstruction of the IFI's interaction with the Swiss Old Catholics, see Boer and Smit 2008, 2012; for a short overview in English, cf. Smit 2011, 3–6, 255–57.
- 9 On the Goan priest Antonio Francisco-Xavier Alvarez, see Kamat 2013.
- 10 This presentation of events is based on Anson (1964, 105) and Wright (1907, 276), as well as the letters sent to the Philippines by Stephen Silva (1903a, 1903b).

References

Achutegui, Pedro de and Miguel A. Bernad. 1960. Brent, Herzog, Morayta and Aglipay. *Philippine Studies* 8(3): 568–83.

——. 1961–1972. Religious revolution in the Philippines. 4 vols. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.

- Aglipay, Gregorio. 1904. Obispado Máximo de Filipinas. A nuestros amadisimos hermanos. La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica, 1 Nov.: 205.
- 1906. Printed letter of the "Obispado Maximo de la Iglesia Filipina Independiente," 1 Feb. IFI Archive, OM 1.1, 1903–1910, Box 1, Folder No. 3, Correspondence of Gregorio Aglipay. St. Andrew's Theological Seminary, Quezon City.
- Anderson, Benedict. 2005. Under three flags: Anarchism and the anti-colonial imagination. London: Verso.
- Anson, Peter F. 1964. Bishops at large. London: Faber and Faber.
- Arejola. Tomas. 1903. El Romanismo juzgado por un ilustre Filipino en el Japón. La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica, 8 Nov.: 17–18.
- Baagø, Kaj. 1969. *Pioneers of indigenous Christianity*. Bangalore: Christian Institute for the Study of Religion and Society and the Christian Literature Society.
- Bayly, Christopher. 1996. The Indian ecumene: An indigenous public sphere. In *Empire and information: Intelligence gathering and social communication in India, 1780–1870*, 180–211. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bhattacharya, Neeladri. 2005. Notes towards a conception of the colonial public. In *Civil society,* public sphere and citizenship: Dialogues and perceptions, ed. Rajeev Bhargava and Helmut Reifeld, 130–56. New Delhi: Sage.
- Blanco, John D. 2009. Frontier constitutions: Christianity and colonial empire in the nineteenth-century Philippines. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Boer, Wim H. de and Peter-Ben Smit. 2008. Die frühen Beziehungen zwischen der Iglesia Filipina Independiente und den altkatholischen Kirchen der Utrechter Union [The early relationships between the Iglesia Filipina Independiente and the Old Catholic Churches of the Union of Utrecht]. Internationale Kirchliche Zeitschrift [International Churchly Journal] 98:122–44, 169–90.
- 2012. In necessariis unitas. Hintergründe zu den ökumenischen Beziehungen zwischen der Iglesia Filipina Independiente, den Kirchen der Anglikanischen Gemeinschaft und den altkatholischen Kirchen der Utrechter Union [In necessariis unitas. On the background of the ecumenical relationships between the Iglesia Filipina Independiente, the Churches of the Anglican Communion and the Old Catholic Churches of the Union of Utrecht]. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- Bragado, Erlinda. 2002. Sukimátem: Isabelo de los Reyes revisited. *Philippine Studies* 50(1): 50–74. *Christian Patriot*. 1898. The Queen and the African bishops, 18 June: 5.
- Clifford, Mary D. 1969. Iglesia Filipina Independiente: The revolutionary church. In Studies in Philippine church history, ed. Gerald H. Anderson, 223–55. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Cullinane, Michael. 2003. *Ilustrado politics: Filipino elite responses to American rule, 1898–1908*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.
- Demeterio, Feorillo P. A. 2012. Don Isabelo de los Reyes (1864–1938): Forerunner of Filipino theology. *Philippiniana Sacra* 47:883–916.
- Ervin, Charles W. 2010. Susan de Silva: Feminist rebel and pioneer leftist. Polity 5(5): 14-20.
- Frost, Mark R. 2004. Asia's maritime networks and the colonial public sphere, 1840–1920. *New Zealand Journal of Asian Studies* 6(2): 63–94.

- Gealogo, Francis A. 2010. Time, identity, and nation in the *Aglipayan Novenario ng Balintawak* and *Calendariong Maanghang. Philippine Studies* 58(1–2): 147–68.
- 2011. Religion, science, and bayan in the Iglesia Filipina Independiente. In From wilderness to nation: Interrogating bayan, ed. Damon L. Woods, 108–21. Quezon City: University of the Philippines Press.
- Habermas, Rebekka. 2008. Mission im 19. Jahrhundert Globale Netze des Religiösen [Mission in the 19th century – Global Networks of Religion]. Historische Zeitschrift [Historical Journal] 287(3): 629–79.
- Habermas, Rebekka and Richard Hölzl, eds. 2014. Mission global. Eine Verflechtungsgeschichte seit dem 19. Jahrhundert [Global missions. An entangled history since the 19th century]. Cologne: Böhlau.
- Hermann, Adrian. 2013. Transregional contacts between independent Catholic churches in Asia around 1900: The case of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente and the independent Catholics of Ceylon. In *Veränderte Landkarten. Auf dem Weg zu einer polyzentrischen Geschichte des Weltchristentums* [Changed maps. Toward a polycentric history of World Christianity], ed. Ciprian Burlacioiu and Adrian Hermann, 139–150. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- 2014. Transnational networks of Philippine Christian intellectuals and the emergence of an indigenous-Christian public sphere around 1900. In *Polycentric structures in the history of* World Christianity / Polyzentrische Strukturen in der Geschichte des Weltchristentums, ed. Klaus Koschorke and Adrian Hermann, 193–203. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Herzog, Eduard. 1903. Letter to Gregorio Aglipay, 1 Dec. IFI Archive, OM 1.1, 1903–1905, Box 1, Folder 1. St. Andrew's Theological Seminary, Quezon City.
- La Iglesia Filipina Independiente: Revista Católica. 1903a. A Libertas, 29 Nov.: 32.
- ——. 1903b. Nuestra aspiración, 14 Oct.: 1.
- Jensz, Felicity and Hanna Acke, eds. 2013. Missions and media. The politics of missionary periodicals in the long nineteenth century. Stuttgart: Steiner.
- Kamat, Pratima P. 2013. The Goa–Ceylon Religious Connection: A Review of the 'The Indian Cry' of Alvares Mar Julius, Archbishop of Ceylon, Goa and India. Sabaragamuwa University Journal 12(1): 61–82.
- Koschorke, Klaus. 2011. "When is India to have her own native bishops?" Der schwarzafrikanische Bischof Samuel Ajayi Crowther (ca. 1806–1891) in der christlichen Publizistik Asiens und Afrikas im 19. Jahrhundert [The black African bishop Samuel Ajayi Crowther (ca. 1806–1891) in Christian periodicals in Asia and Africa in the 19th Century]. Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft [Journal of Mission Studies and Religious Studies] 95:315–24.
- ——. 2014. New maps of the history of world Christianity: Current challenges and future perspectives. Theology Today 71:178–91.
- Lahiri, Smita. 2007. Rhetorical indios: Propagandists and their publics in the Spanish Philippines. Comparative Studies in Society and History 49(2): 243–75.
- Manaligod, Ambrocio M. 1977. *Gregorio Aglipay: Hero or villain?* Manila: Communication Foundation for Asia
- Mgadla, Part T. and Stephen C. Volz, eds. 2006. Words of Batswana. Letters to Mahoko a becwana, 1883–1896. Cape Town: Van Riebeeck Society.

- Mojares, Resil B. 2006. Brains of the nation: Pedro Paterno, T. H. Pardo de Tavera, Isabelo de Los Reyes, and the production of modern knowledge. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.
- Ranche, Apolonio M. 2000. The Iglesia Filipina Independiente (IFI): A people's movement for national freedom, independence and prosperity. *Philippiniana Sacra* 35:513–34.
- Revollido, Eleuterio J. 2009. The interplay of nationalism and ecumenism in the ministry of the nine supreme bishops of the IFI: 1902–2002. PhD diss., University of Santo Tomas.
- Rodell, Paul A. 1988. The founding of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente (the "Aglipayan" Church): An historiographical review. *Philippine Quarterly of Culture and Society* 16(3–4): 210–34.
- Rodriguez, P. Isacio R. 1960. *Gregorio Aglipay y los orígenes de la Iglesia Filipina Independiente* (1898–1917). 2 vols. Madrid: Departamento de Misionologia Española, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas.
- Schumacher, John N. 1981. Revolutionary clergy: The Filipino clergy and the nationalist movement, 1850–1903. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.
- Scott, William Henry. 1963. The Philippine Independent Church in history. Silliman Journal 10(3): 298–310.
- . 1987. Aglipay before Aglipayanism. Quezon City: Aglipayan Resource Center.
- ——. 1992. The Union Obrera Democratica: First Filipino labor union. Quezon City: New Day.
- Silva, Stephen. 1903a. Letter to Gregorio Aglipay, 23 Apr. IFI Archive, OL 1462. St. Andrew's Theological Seminary, Quezon City.
- 1903b. Letter to José Evangelista, 11 July. IFI Archive, OL 1465. St. Andrew's Theological Seminary. Quezon City.
- Smit, Peter-Ben. 2011. Old Catholic and Philippine Independent ecclesiologies in history. The Catholic Church in every place. Leiden: Brill.
- 2013. Von Kolonialkirche zur indigenen Theologie. Die Geschichte der Iglesia Filipina Independiente anhand ihrer Interpretation der Bibel [From colonial church to indigenous theology. The history of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente on the basis of its interpretation of the Bible]. Jahrbuch für europäische Überseegeschichte [Yearbook of European Overseas History] 11:95–115.
- Switzer, Les and Donna Switzer. 1979. The black press in South Africa and Lesotho. A descriptive bibliographic guide to African, coloured and Indian newspapers, newsletters and magazines 1836–1976. Boston: G. K. Hall.
- Thomas, Megan C. 2006. Isabelo de los Reyes and the Philippine contemporaries of *La Solidaridad*. *Philippine Studies* 54(3): 381–411.
- ———. 2012. Orientalists, propagandists, and ilustrados: Filipino scholarship and the end of Spanish colonialism. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Torre, Michael D., ed. and trans. 2013. Do not resist the Spirit's call: Francisco Marín-Sola on sufficient grace. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press.
- La Verdad. 1903. Los Católicos americanos, no Romanistas, 10 June: 5.
- Whittemore, Lewis B. 1961. Struggle for freedom: History of the Philippine Independent Church. Greenwich: Seabury Press.

Wright, Arnold, ed. 1907. Twentieth century impressions of Ceylon. Its history, people, commerce, industries and resources. London: Lloyd's Greater Britain Publishing.

Adrian Hermann is a visiting scholar (2014–2015), Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies, Utrecht University, The Netherlands; and the Department of Anthropology, Stanford University, USA. In 2011 he received a doctorate in the Study of Religion from the University of Basel, Switzerland. From 2012 to August 2014 he was a postdoctoral researcher at the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich, Germany. His main research interests include the early history of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente, global Christianity (with a focus on Southeast Asia), religious modernisms, method and theory in the study of religion, and the history of religion in a globalized world. <adrian.hermann@gmail.com>