

philippine studies

Ateneo de Manila University • Loyola Heights, Quezon City • 1108 Philippines

**Saint Francis Xavier by James Brodrick, S.J.; and
The Fire of Francis Xavier by Arthur McGratty, S.J.**

Review Author: Arthur A. Weiss

Philippine Studies vol. 1, no. 1 (1953): 90–92

Copyright © Ateneo de Manila University

Philippine Studies is published by the Ateneo de Manila University. Contents may not be copied or sent via email or other means to multiple sites and posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's written permission. Users may download and print articles for individual, noncommercial use only. However, unless prior permission has been obtained, you may not download an entire issue of a journal, or download multiple copies of articles.

Please contact the publisher for any further use of this work at philstudies@admu.edu.ph.

<http://www.philippinestudies.net>

technically difficult concepts of philosophy and theology, especially those found in the Epistles of St. Paul. Tagalog, furthermore, lacks specific terms for many ideas and objects in everyday use, and, for some shades of meaning, the translator must resort to coined words or to awkward roundabout expressions.

Careful editing and clear modern print combine to make *Ang Bagong Tipan* an attractive and readable volume. Its format is somewhat modeled after the popular Confraternity Edition of the New Testament published in the United States. Headings in bold-face type conveniently break up the text into logical groupings. This arrangement has the advantage of avoiding monotony and of giving the reader a general idea of the section he is reading. There are also abundant footnotes, a glossary to explain unfamiliar terms, and maps to make the reading of the New Testament as helpful as possible.

Ang Bagong Tipan could find an honored place in the teaching of the national language. It was the reviewer's good fortune to have been in contact with the translation even before it was published in book form. He used it to good advantage in his Tagalog classes at San Jose Seminary. The students were occasionally made to translate a familiar passage of the Gospel from English into Tagalog, and then their efforts were compared with Fr. Trinidad's translation of the same passage. The class generally agreed that their attempts sounded labored and unwieldy beside the smoothly running, economically phrased, precise sentences of Fr. Trinidad. It would not be an exaggeration to say that non-Tagalog students could learn much of the genius of the Tagalog language by frequent readings from this new translation. But it is primarily in the field of religion that this work of Fr. Trinidad will render signal service. Throughout the ages, seekers after truth have come to know and love and serve God better by reading and meditating on the lessons of the Gospels made known to them through their own native tongues. This modern translation will bring its Tagalog readers to a greater appreciation of and loyalty to the Personality of Christ, and many others who do not yet know the treasures of the divinity hidden in Christ will find in these pages the Light that is Life.

ANTONIO LEETAI

SAINT FRANCIS XAVIER. By James Brodrick, S.J. Wicklow Press
New York; Burns, Oates, London. 1952. pp. 548. P12.00

THE FIRE OF FRANCIS XAVIER. By Arthur McGratty, S.J. Bruce
Publishing Co., Milwaukee. 1952. pp. 295. P9.50

The year 1952, marking the fourth centenary of the death of

Saint Francis Xavier, gave us two works in English on the life of the Saint. Father Brodrick's biography was published both in England and in the United States. The English edition has 16 illustrations and five maps which are lacking in the American edition. The maps are helpful, especially the enlarged map of Cape Comorin coast. The Comorin map helps the readers through the complication of events that took place there due to the wars of the various rajahs of the region. Father Brodrick has taken great pains to describe these events but at the expense of wearying, and perhaps, of confusing the reader still more. On the other hand, Father McGratty brushes off these rajahs with less than a page. The illustrations of the English edition are well done. There is an excellent picture of the shrine at Sancian showing the China coast in the distance. The caption states that the shrine "marks the spot where St. Francis died." This is a mistake. The shrine was built over the first burial place; the exact spot of the death has never been ascertained.

In any new biography of Xavier, the reader already familiar with the saint's life will inevitably pay attention to the way in which the biographer treats Xavier's miracles, his alleged gift of tongues, and his frequent moving from place to place. Father Brodrick subscribes to the now fairly well proven thesis that Xavier did not have the gift of tongues, at least not as a normal possession, and that, although he was the "heavenly hustler" yet he saw to it that his neo-converts were not neglected. On these two points McGratty is in agreement with Brodrick and is a definite improvement on the latter, portraying for us more of the heart and soul of Xavier and showing us more of his motives. Also, Father McGratty points out Xavier's true *missionary understanding* of the Asiatic—a point which Father Brodrick seems to miss.

It is when we come to the miracles that the otherwise balanced work of Father Brodrick seems to lose itself in a maze of explanations. So strong is Father Brodrick's desire to overcome the penchant of Xavier's older biographers for multiplying miracles that even a hint of the miraculous sets him looking in all directions for a natural explanation. His treatment of the "miracle of the crab" is typical. For this event we have the sworn and documented evidence of two witnesses—one, the eye-witness, in the Philippines, and the other in India. The first witness, Fausto Rodriguez, testified to the happening in a sworn statement before the Rector of the Jesuit College in Cebu. Brodrick is suspicious because the man had kept the event a secret for 67 years. But it is Brodrick himself who tells us that there is evidence that the so-called miracle was not kept a secret, for he tells us that the one hundred and fifth witness at the official investigations held at Quilon in 1616 testified that at that time the miracle was "*publica et notoria*" in India. Brodrick puts the deposition of Rodriguez in Cebu in the year 1613. He does not seem

to be aware that Rodriguez made *two* depositions and that the first was made, also in Cebu, in 1608. In this deposition the eye witness of the "miracle" explicitly states that he is seventy-four years of age. This would make him twelve years of age at the time of the event and not of "man's estate" and a "gunner in the Portuguese navy," as Brodrick surmises. Father Brodrick continues to play the Devil's Advocate by looking around for an explanation other than the testimony of the two witnesses and thinks that there might have been a "crab-myth" coming from Japan or India which could have given rise to the story. Another solution he suggests is that a crab might by sheer coincidence, have picked the crucifix out of the water and walked along the shore with it at the very moment Rodriguez and Xavier were passing by! Father McGratty's comments on Xavier's miracles are much more balanced nor does he strive for any far fetched explanations.

Brodrick's work, while giving evidence of wide reading, seems to lack the necessary depth of research into primary sources. This shows up in the way he uses Mendez Pinto in one instance and, in another, sharply criticizes him for his almost total lack of accuracy. Another example of his not using primary sources is his assertion that in 1549 Xavier had "not more than ten men to supply all the needs of India, Malacca, the Moluccas and Japan." Later on Brodrick himself tells us that in 1549 there were 17 Jesuit priests in the Portuguese mission and we know from the sources that in 1549 there were at least 40 Jesuits on that mission, including the scholastics and brothers. Moreover, for all the scholarly apparatus of foot-notes attached to Father Brodrick's life there would seem to be lacking a *unified* picture of Xavier, the *saint*.

It is precisely this unity that Father McGratty achieves. Keeping to the facts, he has made a successful attempt to see Xavier as a *whole* and to emphasize his *sanctity*. The first seven chapters (one third of the book) tell the story of the spiritual influences that went to bear on Xavier's early years and, in doing so, give much about the relations of the first Jesuits to their founder, Saint Ignatius. It is McGratty's thesis that we cannot appreciate Saint Francis unless we understand the Ignatian spirituality in which he was formed. This thesis is not contested of course. In the light of Brodrick's treatment, it helps us to realize that a saint is more than a historical figure. To write the details of his life work, no matter how accurately these details may have been scrutinized for their historical correctness, does not guarantee that anything more has been written than an interesting series of events. Father McGratty has succeeded in giving us a worthwhile and readable biography of Xavier—the *Saint*.

Both books are eminently worth reading. It is the opinion of this reviewer, however, that the "definitive" English life of the great Apostle of the Indies has yet to be written. ARTHUR A. WEISS